

識別番号 L 1 2007 年度完了学内共同研究
研究課題 靖国神社事件を見直す：1930 年代の国家と宗教
“Jesuits and Learning in East and West”

研究代表者 Kate Nakai

共同研究者 Linda Grove, Jean-Claude Hollerich, Kawamura Shinzo, [Harald Fuess]

Summary This project began in April 2006 with the intention of collecting oral history interviews with older members of the Society of Jesus who could provide first-person accounts with regard to various aspects of university history. During the first year of the project, the research group representative Professor Harald Fuess [Faculty of Liberal Arts], in consultation with other members of the group, drew up a list of individuals to interview and began to conduct interviews. The transcripts of some of these interviews—together with several conducted by other members of the project (Profs. Kate Nakai and Linda Grove)—are attached as Part 2 of the report.

Prof. Fuess resigned from the university in the summer of 2007, and Prof. Kate Nakai became the new representative for the research project. During the second year of the project, stress was placed on the collection and transcription of documentary materials related to the well-known Yasukuni Incident of 1932. In May of 1932 the military training officer assigned to Sophia University, Colonel Kitahara, took students to the Yasukuni Shrine, presumably to pay a visit to the war history museum, the Yushukan. Before visiting the museum the students were told to “sanpai,” and several of the Catholic students did not do so. This incident was reported back to the Army Ministry, and resulted in an extended struggle—with the Army Ministry withdrawing the military training officer in December of 1932, and not finally appointing a new officer until late in the following year. When the Sophia University collection of historical materials was compiled in the 1980s, some materials on the Yasukuni Incident were included in volume 3, and materials discovered later were included in the supplementary volume published in 1993. Profs. Nakai and Grove had been using these materials in teaching a class on historical methodology for many years, and students in the class had discovered some additional materials. We decided to use this opportunity to make a more comprehensive search for materials.

Scope of the Materials

While the failure of several Sophia students to bow before the Yasukuni Shrine in May 1932 may seem like a relatively minor matter, the incident touched off a major struggle that ultimately involved not only the University and the Army Ministry, but also the Ministry of Education, the Catholic Church in Japan, the Vatican and its representatives in Japan, and a number of Catholic high schools. Within Japan, reports of the incident in major newspapers touched off debates that also came to involve various political and religious groups, as well as those interested in questions related to State Shinto and constitutional issues related to the guarantee of freedom of religion. On the Church side, the issue touched on how one was to understand the First

Commandment and the Church's traditional teaching on what acts were regarded as "superstitious" and therefore banned for believers.

The Church's understanding of these issues had been shaped by the well-known controversy in the early 18th century in China known as the Chinese rites controversy. That dispute began as the result of different interpretations of the fundamental character of certain Confucian rituals, including those that were expected of all civil officials, as well as the regular ceremonies held in honor of a family's ancestors. Pope Clement XI in 1715 followed the interpretation of the Dominicans who believed such rites were superstitious, ruling against the Jesuits (and their supporter the Kangxi Emperor) who believed that such rites were primarily civil and therefore could be tolerated. That position on indigenous ritual practices had remained the Church's position since 1715, and was the authority behind decisions on "sanpai" and other common practices in Japan associated with Shinto shrines. (See George Minamiki, S.J., *The Chinese Rites Controversy: from its beginnings to modern times*, Loyola University Press, 1985). The Sophia University Yasukuni incident, and the crisis it created for the survival of not only the university, but also the Catholic Church in Japan at a time of extreme pressure from rising nationalism, eventually led the Sacred Congregation of Propaganda Fide to make a new ruling that—under carefully limited circumstances—allowed Catholic believers to participate in such "civic" rites.

The materials that we have collected for this project include many newly discovered materials that were not included in the collection of Sophia historical materials. The 93 documents included with this report cover not only the Sophia incident, but also materials from Kaisei High School in Nagasaki, which was also threatened with withdrawal of its military officer, and other related materials from various archives. In addition, we have collected a file of 86 newspaper and magazine articles—which includes reports from the major national newspapers, from newspapers associated with various political groups (including rightist political groups), Catholic and Protestant journals published in Japan, and educational journals. The materials give a window onto the heated debates at the time over these issues, and make it much easier to understand why this incident, which began with a few students, was to have such far-reaching implications both within in Japan and in the worldwide Catholic Church.

Project Process

The first part of the project involved searching for and copying materials from relevant archives, libraries and special collections. Some of the materials—including some of the documents related to the Kaisei Incident—were already in the collection of the Sophia University history office. We have added to that collection of documents by carrying out a more thorough search of national archival collections. Much of the work of searching—both for archives and other materials—was done by a research assistant, Mr. Sanari Toshikiyo, who received his M.A. in Comparative Culture from Sophia University as a mature student. Mr. Sanari, who is now retired, tracked down documents and newspaper and magazine articles, and has made a major effort to identify individuals referred to in the various documents. (See appendixes to Part 1).

Since there are very few indexes to newspapers of the 1930s, the search for newspaper and magazine articles was a time-consuming process. Students in our classes in the past, and Mr. Sanari in connection with this project, searched major newspapers issue by issue for 1932-33, as well as looking at magazines published by various religious and educational organizations. The result is the current collection of articles.

Once the archival materials, many of which were hand written, and the copies of the newspaper articles had been acquired, we sought the assistance of two graduate students in the graduate program in Japanese literature to produce typed versions of the documents in preparation for publication. Copies of all original documents, copies of newspaper and magazine articles, etc. are in a file in the office of the research group's representative. We plan to make a copy of all of the materials for the University history office.

Next Steps

We are still in the process of searching for materials in the archives of the Vatican. One member of our group, Prof. Jean Claude Hollerich, is responsible for this part of the project. Vatican archives, including diplomatic archives, are now open through 1939, and we expect to be able to add interesting materials on the interchange between the Catholic Church in Japan and the Vatican over this issue.

Once all of the materials have been collated and checked, we plan to publish—through a commercial press—a collection of the materials with interpretive essays and commentary.